



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL:

November 23, 2021

Jpechous@jurupavalley.org

Jim Pechous, Principal Planner

City of Jurupa Valley, Community Development Department

8930 Limonite Avenue

Jurupa Valley, California 92509

Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the Proposed Rubidoux Commerce Park Project (Proposed Project) (SCH No.: 2020110449)

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The City of Jurupa Valley is the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Lead Agency for the Proposed Project. The following comments on the Draft EIR includes recommended revisions to existing mitigation measure 4.2-2, additional recommended operational mitigation measures, and a discussion of South Coast AQMD permits that the Lead Agency should include in the Final EIR.

Based on the Draft EIR, the Proposed Project consists of construction and operation of two new warehousing buildings totaling 1,299,358 square feet on 81.3 acres. The Proposed Project is located on the southeast corner of Montana Avenue and 25th Street within the City of Jurupa Valley. The Project site is bisected by the Union Pacific Railroad; however, warehousing activity occurring by rail is not anticipated and therefore is not discussed in the Draft EIR¹.

Construction of the Proposed Project is anticipated to begin in 2021 and will be completed by 2023². The Proposed Project does not include project design features related to air quality³. Once operational, the Proposed Project is anticipated to generate 2,874 trip-ends per day, 516 of which would be made by light-, medium-, and heavy-heavy-duty trucks⁴. Although the tenant for the Proposed Project is unknown at the time of the release of the Draft EIR, the Proposed Project is not anticipated to include refrigerated uses⁵. Based on the Draft EIR, existing sensitive receptors (i.e., residential units) are within 41 feet of the Proposed Project⁶.

Based on a review of the Draft EIR and supporting technical documents, South Coast AQMD staff has three main comments. A summary of these comments is provided as follows with additional details provided in the attachment.

¹ Draft EIR. Chapter 1 Executive Summary. Page 1-2.

² Draft EIR. Chapter 3.0 Project Description. Page 3-26.

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ Draft EIR. Section 4.2 Air Quality Page 4.2-44.

⁵ Draft EIR. Chapter 3.0 Project Description. Page 3-13.

⁶ *Ibid.* Page 4.2-46.

1. Recommended Revisions to Existing Mitigation Measure (MM) 4.2-2: CEQA requires that mitigation measures are capable of minimizing or reducing significant adverse impacts. The Lead Agency included MM 4.2-2, which requires the Project applicant to provide information to the Project occupant on funding opportunities for cleaner-than-required engines and equipment. While information sharing is important, providing information alone does not directly generate emission reductions or reduce impacts. Therefore, to directly reduce the Proposed Project's significant and unavoidable operational air quality impacts from NO_x emissions, South Coast AQMD staff recommends the Lead Agency strengthen the existing mitigation measure to require the use of zero-emission and near-zero emission trucks during operations.
2. Additional Recommended Air Quality Mitigation Measures: CEQA requires that the Lead Agency considers all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized to minimize or eliminate any significant adverse air quality impacts. South Coast AQMD staff recommends the Lead Agency include additional mitigation measures such as design features to further reduce the Proposed Project's significant and unavoidable operational air quality impacts from NO_x emissions and associated exposures.
3. Responsible Agency and South Coast AQMD Permits: If the Proposed Project will require the use of stationary equipment such as emergency generator(s) and fire pump(s), permit(s) from South Coast AQMD will be required. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends the Lead Agency identify stationary equipment that will be required during operation and identify South Coast AQMD as a CEQA Responsible Agency for the Proposed Project in the Final EIR.

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Alina Mullins, Air Quality Specialist, at amullins@aqmd.gov, should you have any questions or wish to discuss the comments.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

Attachment
LS:AM
RVC211021-01
Control Number

ATTACHMENT**South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Air Quality Analysis and Health Risk Assessment in the Draft EIR**

In the Air Quality Analysis Section of the Draft EIR, the Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's maximum daily construction and operational emissions. The Lead Agency compared the Proposed Project's construction and operational emissions to the respective South Coast AQMD's recommended regional air quality CEQA significance thresholds. Based on the analysis, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's regional construction air quality impacts would be less than significant. The Lead Agency also found that that the Proposed Project's regional operational air quality impacts would be significant with an estimated 97 pounds per day (lbs/day) of NO_x emissions, which would exceed South Coast AQMD's CEQA significance threshold for regional operational NO_x emissions at 55 lbs/day⁷. To reduce the significant NO_x emissions, the Lead Agency will implement Mitigation Measures (MMs) 4.2-1 through 4.2-5, which require idling limitation signage, installation of conduit to support electric vehicle parking for tractor trailers, electric indoor material handling equipment, and electric cargo handling equipment, as feasible⁸. However, the Lead Agency found that operation of the Proposed Project would still result in significant and unavoidable air quality impacts from NO_x emissions at 97 lbs/day⁹.

In the Draft EIR, the Lead Agency also quantified the Proposed Project's localized construction and operational emissions and compared them to the applicable South Coast AQMD's localized significance thresholds. Based on the analysis, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's localized construction air quality impacts would result in 13 lbs/day of PM emissions, which would exceed South Coast AQMD's localized significance threshold for the Source Receptor Area of Riverside. However, implementation of MM 4.2-6 would require all actively graded areas during construction to be watered four times per day¹⁰. This would reduce localized PM emissions to below significance at 10 lbs/day¹¹. Localized operational air quality impacts were found to be less than significant¹².

Additionally, the Lead Agency calculated cancer risks from Proposed Project's construction and operational activities and found that they would result in a cancer inhalation risk of less than one million and 0.84 in one million¹³, respectively, both of which would not exceed South Coast AQMD's CEQA significance threshold of 10 in one million for cancer risk¹⁴. Finally, the Lead Agency discussed South Coast AQMD Rules 2305 and 316¹⁵ in the Draft EIR.

⁷ *Ibid.* Page 4.2-43.

⁸ Draft EIR. Chapter 1 Executive Summary. Pages 1-2 through 1-3.

⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰ Appendix B Air Quality Impact Analysis. Page 54.

¹¹ *Ibid.*

¹² *Ibid.* Page 56.

¹³ Appendix D Construction Health Risk Assessment Memorandum, Page 9 and; Appendix B Air Quality Impact Analysis Page 5.

¹⁴ South Coast AQMD's CEQA significance threshold of 10 in one million for cancer risk is based on the most current methodology recommended by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard assessment.

¹⁵ Draft EIR. Section 4.2 Air Quality. Page 4.2-41.

South Coast AQMD staff's detailed comments on the Draft EIR is provided as follows.

1. Recommended Revisions to MM 4.2-2

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4, mitigation measures are those capable of minimizing or reducing significant adverse impacts. In the Draft EIR, the Lead Agency incorporates MM 4.2-2, which requires that the Project applicant provide information to future occupants/tenants of the Project site about funding opportunities for cleaner-than-required engines and equipment, such as the Carl Moyer Program¹⁶. While it is important to share information about South Coast AQMD's Carl Moyer Program and the State's clean truck fleets programs, providing information alone does not minimize or reduce emissions. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency strengthen MM 4.2-2 and incorporate the following revisions, which will require the use of zero-emission (ZE) or near-zero emission (NZE) heavy-duty trucks during operation in the Final EIR.

MM 4.2-2

- Prior to the issuance of an occupancy permit, the Project applicant or successor in interest shall provide documentation to the City demonstrating that occupants/tenants of the Project site have been provided documentation on funding opportunities, such as the Carl Moyer Program, that provides incentives for using cleaner than required engines and equipment. Require the use of ZE or NZE on-road trucks during operation such as heavy-duty trucks with natural gas engines that meet the CARB's adopted optional NOx emissions standard at 0.02 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr), if and when feasible. Given the state's clean truck rules and regulations aiming to accelerate the utilization and market penetration of ZE and NZE trucks such as the Advanced Clean Trucks Rule¹⁷ and the Heavy-Duty Low NOx Omnibus Regulation¹⁸, ZE and NZE trucks will become increasingly more available to use, especially during the operational lifetime of the Proposed Project, which begins in 2022. The Lead Agency should require a phase-in schedule to incentive the use of these cleaner operating trucks to reduce any significant adverse air quality impacts during operation. South Coast AQMD staff is available to discuss the availability of current and upcoming truck technologies and incentive programs with the Lead Agency. Include these truck requirements in applicable bid documents, purchase orders, and contracts. Operators shall maintain records of all trucks associated with project construction to document that each truck used meets these emission standards, and make the records available for inspection.

2. Additional Recommended Air Quality Mitigation Measures

In the Draft EIR, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project would result in significant and unavoidable air quality impacts from NOx emissions during operation of the Proposed Project. CEQA requires that the Lead Agency consider mitigation measures to minimize significant adverse impacts (CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4) and that all feasible mitigation

¹⁶ Draft EIR. Chapter 1 Executive Summary. Page 1-1.

¹⁷ CARB. June 25, 2020. *Advanced Clean Trucks Rule*. Accessed at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/advanced-clean-trucks>.

¹⁸ CARB has recently passed a variety of new regulations that require new, cleaner heavy-duty truck technology to be sold and used in state. For example, on August 27, 2020, CARB approved the Heavy-Duty Low NOx Omnibus Regulation, which will require all trucks to meet the adopted emission standard of 0.05 g/hp-hr starting with engine model year 2024. Accessed at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/rulemaking/2020/hdomnibuslownox>.

measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized to minimize or eliminate any significant adverse impacts. South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency consider including the following operational mitigation measures in the Final EIR to further reduce the Proposed Project's operational NOx emissions from mobile sources that will be attracted to the Proposed Project during operation and associated exposures, particularly by those living in close proximity (e.g., within 41 feet) to the Proposed Project.

Mitigation measures for operational air quality impacts from mobile sources that the Lead Agency should consider in the Final EIR may include the following:

- Limit the daily number of trucks allowed at the Proposed Project to levels analyzed in the Final EIR (i.e., 516 daily truck trips). If higher daily truck volumes are anticipated to visit the site, the Lead Agency should commit to re-evaluating the Proposed Project through CEQA prior to allowing a higher activity level than previously analyzed.

Design considerations for the Proposed Project that the Lead Agency should consider to further reduce air quality and health risk impacts include the following:

- Clearly mark truck routes with trailblazer signs to ensure trucks avoid traversing through the existing residential area along 28th Street and south of Avalon Street.
- Restrict overnight truck parking in sensitive land uses by providing overnight truck parking inside the Proposed Project site.
- Design the Proposed Project such that any check-in point for trucks is well inside the Proposed Project site to ensure that there are no trucks queuing outside of the facility.
- Establish area(s) within the Proposed Project site for repair needs and ensure that these designated areas are away from any sensitive receptors.

3. Responsible Agency and South Coast AQMD Permits

If implementation of the Proposed Project requires the use of stationary equipment, including but is not limited to, emergency generator(s) and emergency fire pump(s), permits from South Coast AQMD are required. The Final EIR should include a discussion on stationary equipment that will require South Coast AQMD permits and identify South Coast AQMD as a Responsible Agency for the Proposed Project. Any assumptions used in the Final EIR will be used as the basis for permit conditions and limits for the Proposed Project. The 2015 revised Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) methodology is being used by South Coast AQMD for determining operational health risks for permitting applications and also for all CEQA projects where South Coast AQMD is the Lead Agency. Please contact South Coast AQMD's Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-3385 for questions on permits. For more general information on permits, please visit South Coast AQMD's webpage at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits>.

Conclusion

Pursuant to California Public Resources Code Section 21092.5(a) and CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(b), South Coast AQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency provide South Coast AQMD staff with written responses to all comments contained herein prior to the certification of the Final EIR. In addition, issues raised in the comments should be addressed in detail giving reasons why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted. There should be good faith, reasoned analysis in response. Conclusory statements unsupported by factual information will not suffice (CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(c)). Conclusory statements do not facilitate the purpose and goal of CEQA on public disclosure and are not meaningful, informative, or useful to decision makers and to the public who are interested in the Proposed Project. Further, if the Lead Agency makes the finding that the recommended additional mitigation measures are not feasible, the Lead Agency should describe the specific reasons supported by substantial evidence for rejecting them in the Final EIR (CEQA Guidelines Section 15091).