



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • [www.aqmd.gov](http://www.aqmd.gov)

SENT VIA USPS AND E-MAIL:

May 12, 2017

[Lstowe@cvwd.org](mailto:Lstowe@cvwd.org)

Mr. Luke Stowe, Environmental Supervisor  
Coachella Valley Water District  
75515 Hovley Lane East  
Palm Desert, CA 92211

## **Notice of Preparation of a Draft Environmental Impact Report for the Palm Desert Groundwater Replenishment Project**

The South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The SCAQMD staff's comments are recommendations regarding the analysis of potential air quality impacts from the proposed project that should be included in the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR). Please send SCAQMD a copy of the Draft EIR upon its completion. Note that copies of the Draft EIR that are submitted to the State Clearinghouse are not forwarded to SCAQMD. Please forward a copy of the Draft EIR directly to SCAQMD at the address shown in the letterhead. **In addition, please send with the Draft EIR all appendices or technical documents related to the air quality, health risk, and greenhouse gas analyses and electronic versions of all air quality modeling and health risk assessment files<sup>1</sup>. These include emission calculation spreadsheets and modeling input and output files (not PDF files). Without all files and supporting documentation, SCAQMD staff will be unable to complete our review of the air quality analyses in a timely manner. Any delays in providing all supporting documentation will require additional time for review beyond the end of the comment period.**

### **Air Quality Analysis**

The SCAQMD adopted its California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Air Quality Handbook in 1993 to assist other public agencies with the preparation of air quality analyses. The SCAQMD recommends that the Lead Agency use this Handbook as guidance when preparing its air quality analysis. Copies of the Handbook are available from the SCAQMD's Subscription Services Department by calling (909) 396-3720. More recent guidance developed since this Handbook was published is also available on SCAQMD's website at: [http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-\(1993\)](http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-(1993)). SCAQMD staff also recommends that the Lead Agency use the CalEEMod land use emissions software. This software has recently been updated to incorporate up-to-date state and locally approved emission factors and methodologies for estimating pollutant emissions from typical land use development. CalEEMod is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) and replaces the now outdated URBEMIS. This model is available free of charge at: [www.caleemod.com](http://www.caleemod.com).

The SCAQMD has also developed both regional and localized significance thresholds. The SCAQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency quantify criteria pollutant emissions and compare the results to the recommended regional significance thresholds found here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default->

---

<sup>1</sup> Pursuant to the CEQA Guidelines Section 15174, the information contained in an EIR shall include summarized technical data, maps, plot plans, diagrams, and similar relevant information sufficient to permit full assessment of significant environmental impacts by reviewing agencies and members of the public. Placement of highly technical and specialized analysis and data in the body of an EIR should be avoided through inclusion of supporting information and analyses as appendices to the main body of the EIR. Appendices to the EIR may be prepared in volumes separate from the basic EIR document, but shall be readily available for public examination and shall be submitted to all clearinghouses which assist in public review.

[source/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf](http://www.scaqmd.gov/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf). Because the proposed construction would occur over a length of 20 years, it more closely resembles the characteristics of project operation. Therefore, the SCAQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency quantify the proposed project's criterial pollutant emissions and compare the results to the SCAQMD's regional pollutant emissions thresholds to determine the air quality impacts. In addition to analyzing regional air quality impacts, the SCAQMD staff recommends calculating localized air quality impacts and comparing the results to localized significance thresholds (LSTs). LSTs can be used in addition to the recommended regional significance thresholds as a second indication of air quality impacts when preparing a CEQA document. Therefore, when preparing the air quality analysis for the proposed project, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a localized analysis by either using the LSTs developed by the SCAQMD or performing dispersion modeling as necessary. Guidance for performing a localized air quality analysis can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/localized-significance-thresholds>.

The Lead Agency should identify any potential adverse air quality impacts that could occur from all phases of the proposed project and all air pollutant sources related to the proposed project. Air quality impacts from both construction (including demolition, if any) and operations should be calculated. Construction-related air quality impacts typically include, but are not limited to, emissions from the use of heavy-duty equipment from grading, earth-loading/unloading, paving, architectural coatings, off-road mobile sources (e.g., heavy-duty construction equipment) and on-road mobile sources (e.g., construction worker vehicle trips, material transport trips). Operation-related air quality impacts may include, but are not limited to, emissions from stationary sources (e.g., boilers), area sources (e.g., solvents and coatings), and vehicular trips (e.g., on- and off-road tailpipe emissions and entrained dust). Air quality impacts from indirect sources, such as sources that generate or attract vehicular trips, should be included in the analysis.

In the event that the proposed project generates or attracts vehicular trips, especially heavy-duty diesel-fueled vehicles, it is recommended that the lead agency perform a mobile source health risk assessment. Guidance for performing a mobile source health risk assessment ("*Health Risk Assessment Guidance for Analyzing Cancer Risk from Mobile Source Diesel Idling Emissions for CEQA Air Quality Analysis*") can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mobile-source-toxics-analysis>. An analysis of all toxic air contaminant impacts due to the use of equipment potentially generating such air pollutants should also be included.

In addition, guidance on siting incompatible land uses (such as placing homes near freeways) can be found in the California Air Resources Board's *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Perspective*, which can be found at: <http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf>. CARB's Land Use Handbook is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process. Guidance<sup>2</sup> on strategies to reduce air pollution exposure near high-volume roadways can be found at: [https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/rd\\_technical\\_advisory\\_final.PDF](https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/rd_technical_advisory_final.PDF).

### **Mitigation Measures**

In the event that the proposed project generates significant adverse air quality impacts, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized during project construction and operation to minimize these impacts. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4 (a)(1)(D), any impacts resulting from mitigation measures must also be discussed. Several resources are

---

<sup>2</sup> In April 2017, ARB published a technical advisory, *Strategies to Reduce Air Pollution Exposure Near High-Volume Roadways: Technical Advisory*, to supplement ARB's *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective*. This Technical Advisory is intended to provide information on strategies to reduce exposures to traffic emissions near high-volume roadways to assist land use planning and decision-making in order to protect public health and promote equity and environmental justice. Available at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/landuse.htm>.

available to assist the Lead Agency with identifying potential mitigation measures for the proposed project, including:

- Chapter 11 of the SCAQMD *CEQA Air Quality Handbook*
- SCAQMD's CEQA web pages available here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mitigation-measures-and-control-efficiencies>
- SCAQMD's Rule 403 – Fugitive Dust, and the Implementation Handbook for controlling construction-related emissions and Rule 1403 – Asbestos Emissions from Demolition/Renovation Activities
- SCAQMD's Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Plan (MMRP) for the 2016 AQMP available here (starting on page 86): <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/Agendas/Governing-Board/2017/2017-mar3-035.pdf?sfvrsn=5>
- CAPCOA's *Quantifying Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures* available here: <http://www.capcoa.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/11/CAPCOA-Quantification-Report-9-14-Final.pdf>

### **Alternatives**

In the event that the proposed project generates significant adverse air quality and health risks impacts, CEQA requires the consideration and discussion of alternatives to the project or its location which are capable of avoiding or substantially lessening any of the significant effects of the project. The discussion of a reasonable range of potentially feasible alternatives, including a “no project” alternative, is intended to foster informed decision-making and public participation. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.6(d), the EIR shall include sufficient information about each alternative to allow meaningful evaluation, analysis, and comparison with the proposed project.

### **Permits**

In the event that the proposed project requires a permit from SCAQMD, SCAQMD should be identified as a responsible agency for the proposed project. For more information on permits, please visit the SCAQMD webpage at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits>. Questions on permits can be directed to the SCAQMD's Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-3385.

### **Data Sources**

SCAQMD rules and relevant air quality reports and data are available by calling the SCAQMD's Public Information Center at (909) 396-2039. Much of the information available through the Public Information Center is also available at the SCAQMD's webpage (<http://www.aqmd.gov>).

SCAQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to ensure that project air quality and health risk impacts are accurately evaluated and mitigated where feasible. If you have any questions regarding this letter, please contact me at [lsun@aqmd.gov](mailto:lsun@aqmd.gov) or call me at (909) 396-3308.

Sincerely,

*Lijin Sun*

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

LS

RVC170503-01

Control Number