



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

DRAFT AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

Thursday March 24, 2022

1:00 p.m.

1. Welcome, Introductions, and Approval of Minutes

Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer, Planning, Rule Development and Implementation (PRDI), provided welcoming remarks and called for approval of the minutes. Since there were no concerns, the minutes were approved.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

2. Overview of Draft 2022 AQMP

Mr. MacMillan provided an update on development of the Draft 2022 Air Quality Management Plan.

Comments from the Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

Lakshmi Jayaram asked about the definition of black box measures and level of certainty associated with the emission reductions. Mr. MacMillan responded that Clean Air Act Section 182(e)(5) allows flexibility in developing black box measures, but that all measures must be clearly defined three years prior to the attainment year. Furthermore, the Draft 2022 AQMP will provide descriptions of black box measures and specify the targeted source categories. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 24:10.

Ramine Cromartie inquired as to the purpose of two regional public workshops held on the same day. Mr. MacMillan explained that the goal was to engage a wide audience in both the Basin and Coachella Valley. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 27:09.

David Rothbart expressed concerns about the misalignment of climate strategies between partner agencies, such as U.S. EPA and CARB, and South Coast AQMD's strategy to meet the 2015 ozone standard by 2037. Mr. MacMillan acknowledged the issue and stressed the importance of engaging other government agencies for a coordinated approach. Efforts are underway to align with climate goals in the 2035-2045 timeframe through collaboration with relevant agencies. Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer, PRDI, emphasized the need for the federal government to commit to controlling sources under its control. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 28:04.

Dan McGivney inquired whether contingency measures would be included as black box measures in the 2022 AQMP or in a separate State Implementation Plan (SIP) submittal. Mr. MacMillan explained that contingency measures would be addressed separately. Dr. Lee added that the U.S. EPA has not yet provided clear guidance on the specific requirements for contingency measures. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 36:16.

Comments from the Public and Staff Responses:

Mark Abramowitz inquired about the carrying capacity to meet state standards and the environmental consequences of not meeting them. Dr. Sang-Mi Lee, Planning and Rules Manager, PRDI, explained that state standards are more stringent than federal standards. While the carrying capacity is still being finalized, it is unlikely that the attainment strategy will meet the state ozone standards. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 32:02.

3. Updates on 2022 AQMP Proposed Control Strategy

Dr. Lee provided an update on the proposed 2022 AQMP control strategy for stationary, area and mobile sources. Yanrong Zhu, Program Supervisor, PRDI, discussed control strategies for residential and commercial combustion sources at state and local levels. Heather Farr, Planning and Rules Manager, PRDI, discussed limited, strategic VOC controls.

Comments from the Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

Janet Whittick commented on equity issues, including how inequity is defined and how incentives are distributed to low-income households. Mr. MacMillan noted the comment. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:02:41.

Dan McGivney asked if the adopted REgional CLean Air Incentives Market (RECLAIM) Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) transition rules were included in the 2037 baseline emissions. Dr. Lee confirmed their inclusion. Mr. McGivney also inquired about the implementation timeline for residential and commercial building measures. Michael Krause, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer, PRDI, stated that it is too early to determine the timeline as staff is still working on ideas and assessing economic and technological feasibility. Lastly, Mr. McGivney highlighted the potential overlap of reductions between CARB's SIP Strategy and South Coast AQMD's proposed NOx control measures, to which Dr. Lee responded that staff coordinates with CARB to avoid double counting. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:05:22.

Lakshmi Jayaram asked about the inclusion of the Warehouse Indirect Source Rule (ISR) in the 2022 AQMP. Mr. MacMillan confirmed that facility-based mobile source measures are included in the 2022 AQMP and explained that SIP creditable emission reductions associated with ISRs are not credited in an AQMP, but instead at a later date as the rules are being implemented. Ms. Jayaram also inquired regarding measures addressing aircraft emissions. Mr. MacMillan highlighted the uncertainty and challenges associated with controlling this sector. Finally, Ms. Jayaram recommended that staff evaluate the NOx emissions from residential backup generators during Public Safety Power Shutoffs. Mr. MacMillan noted her comments. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:11:59.

Dawn Fenton asked about incentive measures focusing on the accelerated retirement of heavy-duty vehicles. Dr. Lee clarified that heavy-duty vehicles and all other off-road equipment are included in control measure MOB-11. Ms. Fenton also asked what percentage of incentives is for heavy-duty vehicles, to which Mr. MacMillan

responded that more information will follow as the AQMP is developed. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:29:21.

Rita Loof commented on the potential hindrance of conversion to cleaner technology through incentive programs for stationary sources. Mr. Krause stated that this comment could be addressed further in the upcoming Rule 219 working group meeting. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:32:17.

Comments from the Public and Staff Responses:

Mark Abramowitz suggested considering economic indicators other than cost-effectiveness, revisiting rule exemptions to achieve additional reductions, employing New Source Review (NSR) as an attainment strategy, leveraging local governments' emission reduction initiatives, eliminating stationary diesel backup generators, and including solar provisions. Mr. MacMillan noted the comments. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:20:50.

Chadwick Collins thanked staff for their engagement on control measure CTS-01. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:34:40.

4. Draft Attainment Demonstration for the 2015 8-hour Ozone Standard

Dr. Lee presented progress in developing the attainment demonstration for the Draft 2022 AQMP.

Comments from the Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

Lakshmi Jayaram inquired regarding assumptions in the timing of emission reductions and the need to reclassify Coachella Valley to "extreme" nonattainment. Dr. Lee responded that a refined simulation reflecting the anticipated control strategy implementation schedule is underway and the design values would be updated. Mr. MacMillan clarified that Coachella Valley would need to rely on black box emission reductions in order to attain by 2032 which is not allowed for "severe" nonattainment areas. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:44:22.

Scott Weaver asked if the reclassification request to "extreme" nonattainment in Coachella Valley is mandatory. Mr. MacMillan responded that staff intends to propose reclassification of Coachella Valley, but will consider feedback received during the public process. Mr. Weaver inquired regarding mobile source incentive measure emission reductions and expected funding levels. Dr. Lee stated that the 2022 AQMP would specify the funding that would be needed to achieve the estimated reductions. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:48:03.

Comments from the Public and Staff Responses:

Fernando Gaytan asked about the timing of public feedback regarding the Coachella Valley reclassification request. Mr. MacMillan stated there would be a 45-day public comment period for the Draft 2022 AQMP, but feedback would be welcomed at any time. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:51:45.

5. Nomination of AQMD Advisory Group Member to South Coast AQMD Advisory Council

Mr. MacMillan provided a brief overview of the Advisory Council and called for the nomination of a primary member.

Janet Whittick nominated David Rothbart. For additional details, refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:56:20.

6. Other Business

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

7. Public Comment

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Public.

8. Next Meeting

No meeting was scheduled.

Members Present (26)

Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice
Bill Lamarr, California Small Business Alliance
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance
Dan McGivney, SoCalGas
David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works
Dawn Fenton, Volvo
Duane Baker, San Bernardino County Transportation Authority/San Bernardino Council of Governments
Greg Nord, Orange County Transportation Authority
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA
Janet Whittick, California Council of Environmental and Economic Balance
John Ungvarsky, U.S. EPA Region 9
Lakshmi Jayaram, Future Ports
Lori Huddleston, LA Metro
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA
Michael Carroll, Latham & Watkins
Michael Lewis, Southern California Contractors Association
Patty Senecal, Western States Petroleum Association
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads
Priscilla Hamilton, SoCalGas
Ramine Cromartie, Western States Petroleum Association
Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership
Rita Loof, RadTech International
Rongsheng Luo, Southern California Association of Governments
Thomas Jelenić, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles

Public Attendees and Interested Parties Present (47)

Ariel Fideldy, CARB
Ali Ghasemi, Ventura County APCD
Alison Torres
Ana Gonzalez, CCAEJ
Bethmarie Quiambao, SCE
Bridget McCann, Chevron

Draft Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for March 24, 2022

Chadwick Collins, Roof Coatings Manufacturers Association

Craig Sakamoto, PBF

Cynthia Walaitis

Dr. Peter Evangelakis, REMI

Eric Anderson

Evelyn Pineda

Faraz Rizvi

Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice

Frances Keeler

Frank Forbes

Harry Smith

Hilary Lewis

Howard Berman

Jamie Bartolome

Jennifer Williams

John Heintz

John Henkelman, Ventura County APCD

Karin Fickerson

Katrina Fritz

Ken Dami

Leah Louis-Prescott

Luis Amezcua

Mark Abramowitz

Mark Taylor

Marven Norman, CCAEJ

Michael Corbett, Bradford White Corporation

Michelle Zumwalt

Nick Chiappe

Phil Gleason, MIG

Ralph Morris

Resa Barillas, EnviroVoters

Robert G. Orinion

Ross Zelen

Ryan Condensa, Ramboll

Scott Weaver

SSlater

Sylvia Vanderspek, CARB

Tom Swenson

Vernon Hughes, CARB

Victoria Hsu

Yasmine Stutz

South Coast AQMD Staff Present (32)

Barbara Radlein

Cui Ge

Draft Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for March 24, 2022

Daphne Hsu
Elaine Shen
Elham Baranizadeh
Eric Praske
Heather Farr
Ian MacMillan
Jong Hoon Lee
Kathryn Roberts
Kayla Jordan
Kevin Ni
Marc Carreras Sospedra
Mary Reichert
Matt Miyasato
Melissa Maestas
Michael Krause
Paul Wright
Rainbow Yeung
Ranil Dhammapala
Ricky Lai
Rosalee Mason
Rui Zhang
Sang-Mi Lee
Sarah Rees
Anthony Tang
Scott Epstein
Sheri Hanizavareh
Vicki White
Xiang Li
Xinqiu Zhang
Yanrong Zhu