

BOARD MEETING DATE: March 7, 2025

AGENDA NO. 1

MINUTES: Governing Board Monthly Meeting

SYNOPSIS: Attached are the Minutes of the February 7, 2025
Board Meeting.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve the February 7, 2025 Board Meeting Minutes.

Faye Thomas
Clerk of the Boards

FT

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 2025

Notice having been duly given, the regular meeting of the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board was conducted in a hybrid format (in person and remotely via videoconferencing and telephone). Members present:

Senator Vanessa Delgado (Ret.), Chair
Senate Rules Committee Appointee

Councilmember Michael A. Cacciotti, Vice Chair
Cities of Los Angeles County – Eastern Region

Mayor Patricia Lock Dawson
Cities of Riverside County

Supervisor Curt Hagman
County of San Bernardino

Gideon Kracov
Governor's Appointee

Mayor Pro Tem Larry McCallon
Cities of San Bernardino County

Supervisor Holly J. Mitchell
County of Los Angeles

Board Member Veronica Padilla-Campos
Speaker of the Assembly Appointee

Councilmember Nithya Raman
City of Los Angeles

Mayor Pro Tem Carlos Rodriguez
Cities of Orange County

Supervisor Donald P. Wagner
County of Orange

Absent: Supervisor V. Manual Perez
County of Riverside

Vacant: Cities of Los Angeles County – Western Region

For additional details of the Governing Board Meeting, please refer to the recording of the [Webcast](#) at: [Live Webcast \(aqmd.gov\)](#)

CALL TO ORDER: Chair Delgado called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

- Pledge of Allegiance: Led by Mayor Pro Tem McCallon
- Roll Call

Board Member Padilla-Campos, Councilmember Raman, and Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez were not present for roll call. Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez joined the meeting at 9:05 a.m., Councilmember Raman at 9:21 a.m., and Board Member Padilla-Campos at 9:38 a.m.

- Opening Comments

Executive Officer Wayne Nastri reported on the South Coast AQMD's ongoing monitoring, compliance, and communication efforts in response to the Palisades and Eaton wildfires and announced the addition of Agenda Item No. 5 for additional funding for air filtration units; upcoming revisions to PARs 1111 & 1121 to address concerns will be discussed at a Working Group Meeting on February 13, 2024 and February Stationary Source Committee meeting; opening of the application period for the 2025 Governing Board Summer Internship Program; and that the April Governing Board Retreat will be rescheduled. The April 4 Board Meeting will still be held in Palm Desert. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 6:59.

Board Member Kracov commented on the challenges he and his family have faced after losing their home in the recent wildfires and thanked everyone for their support and kindness. He commended the Stationary Source Committee for their continued leadership on PAR 1111 and PAR 1121 and requested that staff briefly comment on the methyl bromide issue in West Long Beach.

Executive Officer Nastri explained that CARB has been monitoring methyl bromide within one of our communities and provided a brief overview of the use of methyl bromide as a fumigant and suggested a more detailed follow-up discussion. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 15:45.

Vice Chair Cacciotti shared photos of debris or other particles that accumulated on a new air filter that was installed at his home, which is located within a 9-mile radius of the Altadena fire; a site visit that he attended with staff at the Eaton Canyon fire site; and members of the San Gabriel Valley Council of Governments Homelessness Committee.

Mayor Lock Dawson announced that GreenPower Motor Co, an electric bus manufacturer, is moving their headquarters to the City Riverside and is the fourth manufacturing facility to become part of Riverside's high-tech ecosystem.

Supervisor Mitchell inquired about the perimeter coverage of the mobile air monitors around the fire areas. She emphasized the need to be clear about how far out the mobile monitors are sampling and communicating information and remedies to the public. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 22:12.

Executive Officer Nastri provided additional information about the mobile monitoring efforts for Palisades and Eaton wildfires. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 22:42.

Chair Delgado introduced Councilmember Brenda Olmos from the City of Paramount, who was seated in the audience, as the newest member appointed to the Board.

Councilmember Olmos introduced herself and commented on the February 6, 2025 Los Angeles City Selection Committee meeting where she was elected to serve on the Board to represent the Cities of Los Angeles County – Western Region. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 24:48.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD – (Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3)

The Public Comment Period on Non-Agenda Items was opened. The following individuals addressed the Board. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 25:30.

Chris Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air
Marven Norman, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice
(CCA EJ) and San Bernardino resident

Key topics raised by the above speakers included:

- Expressed support for PAR 1111 and PAR 1121;
- PARs 1111 & 1121 will achieve considerable NOx emission reductions;
- Highlighted the need to prioritize public health and emission reductions;
- Concerned that the opposition will continue to object and move the goal posts instead of working collaboratively with staff;
- Information and data requested by commenters are available on the South Coast AQMD website; and
- Urged the Board to move forward on adopting these rules.

Theral Golden, West Long Beach Neighborhood Association, commented on the Joint Workshop hosted by CARB on January 30, 2025 in West Long Beach to provide the community with information about methyl bromide. He questioned the accuracy of some of the information that was presented at the workshop and expressed disappointment with the proposed plans to address this issue.

Farris Rosen, Altadena resident, expressed concerns regarding the environmental and health impacts of the Eaton fire on the residents of Altadena and surrounding cities and requested data and information on air sampling.

Nick, a member of the public

Andrea, a member of the public

Debra Kamm, Office of Administrative Hearings Special Education Advisory Committee,

Dave, a member of the public

Randy Mosten, a member of the public

Key topics raised by the above speakers include:

- Oppose PAR 1111 and PAR 1121 and expressed concerns regarding–
 - Electricity demand and grid unreliability
 - Dependency on a single source of energy
 - Economic impact on consumers, schools, small businesses, and low-income residents
 - Low public awareness
 - Rules being pushed through without vetting
 - Lack of consumer choice
- Requested comprehensive cost data and scientific evidence of the relationship between NOx emission reductions and ozone concentrations

Executive Officer Nastri clarified that PARs 1111 and 1121 are for residential furnaces and do not apply to schools. Supervisor Mitchell commented on the harm from the spread of misinformation and pointed out that the title of the proposed rules reflects its applicability to residential furnaces.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, pointed out that solar energy was presented in the 1979 and 1982 AQMPs, and commented on equity issues, and heating and cooling systems in Europe. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 54:46.

There being no further requests to speak, the public comment period was closed for Non-Agenda Items.

Written Comments Submitted Supporting PAR 1111 and PAR 1121

Chris Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air

Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice

Gracyna Mohabir, California Environmental Voters

John M. Erickson, Mayor – City of West Hollywood

Jorge Rivera – Healing and Justice Center

Written Comments Submitted Opposing PAR 1111 and PAR 1121

Barbara Papa	Resolution 3240, City of Upland
Betty Bean	Kathy Hein
Bill Cooper	Lynn Johnson
Bill Haugh	Maria Hernandez
Blair Stewart, Mayo, City of Brea	Mark Attaway
Brian Tisdale, Mayor City of Lake Elsinore	Mary Beckman-Kennedy, Yorba Linda resident
Candace Cooke	Matthew Huddleston, Los Angeles County resident
Charity Farrell, Yorba Linda resident	Norman and Carolyn Elsasser
Christopher and Dale Ward, Ranchos Palos Verdes resident	Phillip Dupper, Mayor – City of Loma Linda
Cindy Delangis	Richard Baskerville
Corrinne Griffiths, Yorba Linda resident	Robert and Elizabeth Davidson
David Hellman, Highland resident	Ruth Plummer, Upland resident
Dawn Smith, Aliso Viejo resident	Scott Voights, Mayor City of Lake Forest
Debra Kamm, Irvine resident	Shelly Hasselbrink, Mayor City of Los Alamitos
Eunice Ulloa, Mayor – City of Chino	Scott Moody
Georgianne Bryant, Placentia resident	Shannon Mancuso, Upland resident
Isidro Perez	Susan Goubert, Yorba Linda resident
J. Anthony Vittal, La Verne resident	T S
Jim Bothwell	Zaid Chaudhry
Joan Lebman	
Joane Genis, Chino Hills resident	
Jocelyn Rubio-Melendrez, Orange County resident	
Katherine Johansen, Tustin resident	

Mayor Pro Tem McCallon commented on the numerous public comments submitted in response to staffs' enhanced outreach efforts. He assured the public that staff is working on changes to PAR 1111 and PAR 1121 to address public feedback and will present those changes at the February 13 Working Group Meeting and at the February 21 Stationary Source Committee meeting. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 58:35.



CONSENT AND BOARD CALENDAR

Items 1 – Action Item/No Fiscal Impact

1. Approve Minutes of January 10, 2025 Board Meeting

Items 2 through 7 – Budget/Fiscal Impact

2. Issue Program Announcement for Lower Emission School Bus Program
3. Execute Contract to Develop and Demonstrate Zero-Emission Transport Refrigeration Unit with Electric-Powered Trailer for Heavy-Duty Vehicles

4. Amend Contracts for Joint Electric Truck Scaling Initiative Pilot Project; and Establish Special Revenue Fund and Recognize Revenue for Ports Charging Infrastructure Projects
5. Modify Existing Contracts for AB 617 Residential Air Filtration Program
6. Authorize Purchase of Telecommunication Services
7. Approve Contract Modification as Approved by MSRC

Items 8 through 14 – Information Only/Receive and File

8. Legislative, Public Affairs and Media Report
9. Hearing Board Report
10. Civil Filings and Civil Penalties Report
11. Intergovernmental Review of Environmental Documents and CEQA Lead Agency Projects
12. Rule and Control Measure Forecast
13. Status Report on Regulation XIII – New Source Review
14. Status Report on Major Ongoing and Upcoming Projects for Information Management

Items 15 through 20 – Reports for Committees, MSRC, and CARB

Note: Note: The January Mobile Source Committee meeting was cancelled. The next regular meeting of the Mobile Source Committee is scheduled for February 21, 2025.

15. Administrative Committee
16. Legislative Committee
17. Stationary Source Committee
18. Technology Committee
19. Mobile Source Review Air Pollution Sources Board Monthly Report
20. California Air Resources Board Monthly Report
21. Items Deferred from Consent and Board Calendar

There were no items deferred.

Disclosures

Mayor Pro Tem McCallon reported that he had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 4 but is required to identify for the record that he is Chair of the MSRC, which is involved in this item.

Supervisor Hagman reported that he had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 4 but is required to identify for the record that he is a member of the MSRC, which is involved in this item.

Councilmember Raman reported that she had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 4 but is required to identify for the record that she is a Councilmember for the City of Los Angeles, which is involved in this item.

General Counsel Gilchrist reported that Board Member Kracov had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 4 but is required to identify for the record that he is a Board Member for CARB, which is involved in this item.

The public comment period was opened for Agenda Item Nos. 1 through 20. The following individuals addressed the Board. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 39:25.

Agenda Item No. 4

Ranji George, a member of the public, expressed concern that funding being allocated is biased toward battery electric vehicles and recommended that the Board set aside more funds for hydrogen technologies. He urged the Board to address electric battery disposal and recycling.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, commented on the harnessing of energy from the sun for charging and technical issues he experienced accessing committee meetings.

There being no further requests to speak, the public comment period was closed for Agenda Item Nos. 1 through 20.

Written Comments Submitted Regarding Agenda Item No. 2

- Adrian Martinez, Los Angeles County Electric Truck and Bus Coalition



Board Action (Items 1 – 20)

MOVED BY CACCIOTTI AND SECONDED BY LOCK DAWSON TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NOS. 1 THROUGH 20 AS RECOMMENDED AND RECEIVE AND FILE THE REPORTS FOR THE BOARD COMMITTEES AND MSRC.

THE MOTION PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Cacciotti, Delgado, Lock Dawson, Hagman, McCallon, Mitchell, Padilla-Campos, Perez, Raman, Rodriguez, and Wagner

NOES: None

ABSENT: Kracov*

*Board Member was temporarily out of the room at the time of the vote.



PUBLIC HEARING

22. Update on Facility-Based Mobile Source Measure Development for Marine Ports

Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer/Planning, Rule Development and Implementation, gave the staff presentation on Agenda Item No. 22. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:06:20.

Supervisor Wagner questioned the shift to a regulatory approach that would require the ports to develop an infrastructure plan instead of working on an MOU agreement. He requested that staff provide an explanation for the shift in approach and expressed concerns with government overreach and regulatory burdens. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:18:45.

Executive Officer Nastri commented on the multiple attempts made in the past to negotiate an MOU with the Ports that were unsuccessful because the parties did not come to an agreement. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:22:11.

Councilmember Raman inquired about the likelihood that the U.S. EPA CPRG funds for investments in infrastructure will be distributed to the Ports. Executive Officer Nastri stated that potential legal actions regarding the President's Executive Orders and grant awards will be addressed in today's closed session. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:26:00.

Councilmember Raman explained that the change in approach is an opportunity for the Ports to step up and provide a plan for moving towards our shared goal of achieving cleaner air for the residents of the South Coast region. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:27:04.

In response to Councilmember Raman's inquiry about the use of the rulemaking process to require that the Ports develop a plan, Executive Officer Nastri responded that a plan approach is not uncommon and that South Coast AQMD has other rules that require plans as well as the implementation of those plans.

Board Member Padilla-Campos commented on the need to move on from the MOU approach as there have been multiple unsuccessful attempts. She asked whether there would be any incentives to ensure that the infrastructure is used once built. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:29:08.

Executive Officer Nastri explained how staff has been working in partnership with the ports to advocate for more funding and this effort began with a trip to Washington DC with the ports, environmental representatives, and labor. The result for South Coast AQMD and the ports is nearly a billion dollars of funding that is focused on goods movement. Staff will continue to work with the ports to advocate for funding to help this region reduce emissions. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:30:31.

Board Member Padilla-Campos expressed concern that the community will continue to suffer because it will take years to build the infrastructure and during that time, there will be no emission reductions or cargo caps imposed. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:32:53.

Executive Officer Nastri explained that we are starting with infrastructure and it is important to build confidence and success with infrastructure as it is the first step. Staff will continue to work with the ports on their own stated goals of zero emissions. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:33:45.

Vice Chair Cacciotti offered a historical perspective spanning almost a decade of efforts by staff to collaborate with the Ports on an MOU approach. He emphasized the need to make progress and expressed support for the infrastructure proposal and highlighted the Board's ongoing willingness to collaborate with the Ports. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:35:06.

Supervisor Mitchell asked whether the South Coast AQMD can facilitate long-term planning to help reduce the turnaround time for utilities to install fueling/charging infrastructure. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:36:50.

Mr. MacMillan commented that the infrastructure plan would help to facilitate long-term planning. At last year's Board Retreat, different technologies that can help with short-term energy needs, while longer-term more permanent infrastructure solutions are completed, were discussed. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:38:11.

Chair Delgado commented on the possibility of deploying experimental technologies in the short term, stating that the "temporary" technologies presented at the Board Retreat last year were interesting and could help with deployment of new technologies. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:39:57.

Board Member Kracov acknowledged the progress at the Ports but emphasized that action is needed now to achieve air quality attainment goals, after spending almost 10 years trying to pursue an MOU. He commented on the collaborative efforts over the years by the Board and staff to strike a balance that is fair and reasonable and highlighted the court decision regarding South Coast AQMD's legal authority to adopt indirect source rules. He called on stakeholders to exert leadership to get this done. 1:40:29.

The public comment period was opened for Agenda Item No. 22. The following individuals addressed the Board. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:50:20.

Artie Mandell, Port of Los Angeles
Angie Gilbride, Maersk
Ashley Winkels, APM Terminals
Heather Tomley, Port of Long Beach
Thomas Jelenić, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
Meghan Weinman, SSA Marine
Sarah Wiltfong, Supply Chain Federation

Alec Mesropian, Bizfed LA
Monica Garcia Diaz, Wilmington Chamber of Commerce

Key topics raised by the above speakers include:

- Commented on the success of the Ports' Clean Air Action Plan, significant investments and progress in achieving emission reductions at the ports;
- Urged South Coast AQMD to prioritize working with the Ports, cities, and key partners on an enforceable port infrastructure agreement and forgo Port ISR;
- Rulemaking will have a negative effect on the region's economy and disrupt delivery of essential commerce; and
- Concerned that a Port ISR would impose cargo caps.

Dori Chandler, Coalition for Clean Air
Chris Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air
Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice
Whitney Amaya, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice (EYCEJ)
Cristhian Tapia-Delgado, Pacific Environment
Andrea Vidaurre, People's Collective for Environmental Justice
Yassi Kavezade, Sierra Club
Fernando Marquez Duarte, People's Collective for Environmental Justice
Marven Norman, CCAEJ
Theral Golden, West Long Beach Neighborhood Association
Sylvia Betancourt, Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma
Jennifer Cardenas, a member of the public
Jan Victor Andasan, EYCEJ

Key topics raised by the above speakers include:

- Expressed support for a strong Port ISR that sets clear emission reduction targets, zero-emission infrastructure planning, transparent reporting and accountability;
- Ports remain the largest source of pollution in the region;
- Ports' Clean Air Action Plan does not have new goals and progress in achieving emission reductions has stalled;
- Commented on the historical perspective of the attempts to negotiate an MOU for the Ports and Railyards; and
- Expressed concerns with the negative impact that port-related activities have on the Inland Empire.

There being no further requests to speak, the public comment period was closed for Agenda Item No. 22.

Written Comments Submitted

- One letter signed by the following organizations: Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice; Gracyna Mohabir, California Environmental Voters; Marven E. Norman, CCAEJ; Dori Chandler, Coalition for Clean Air; Paola Vargas, EYCEJ; Alison Hahm, Natural Resources Defense Council; Cristhian Tapia-Delgado, Pacific Environment; Andrea Viduarre, People's Collective for Environmental Justice; and Theral Golden, West Long Beach Neighborhood Association

(This was a presentation only; no action was required from the Board.)



CLOSED SESSION

The Board recessed to closed session at 11:50 a.m. pursuant to Government Code sections:

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – INITIATING LITIGATION

- 54956.9(a) and 54956.9(d)(4) to consider initiation of litigation in two cases.

Following closed session, General Counsel Gilchrist, announced that there were no reportable actions taken in closed session.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned by General Counsel Gilchrist at 12:25 p.m.

The foregoing is a true statement of the proceedings held by the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board on February 7, 2025.

Respectfully Submitted,

Faye Thomas
Clerk of the Boards

Date Minutes Approved: _____

Vanessa Delgado, Chair

ACRONYMS

- AQMP = Air Quality Management Plan
- CARB = California Air Resources Board
- CEQA = California Environmental Quality Act
- FY = Fiscal Year
- ISR = Indirect Source Rule
- MSRC = Mobile Source Air Pollution Reduction Review Committee
- PAR = Proposed Amended Rule